

Lithgow City Council Tender Evaluation – TEN 05/13

Project: Union Theatre Toilet Upgrade Tender Assessment

A tender will only be accepted following completion of an assessment of all Tenders. The evaluation criteria will be as follows.

Item	Criteria	Weighting
1	<p>Cost (value for money)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Realistic price • Clear break down of costs as per the required schedules • Ability to provide a fixed cost analysis for selected/proposed options any additional or unforeseen repair or construction work 	60
2	<p>Conformance With Tender Submission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Completion of all Tender Schedules • Clean break down of costs as per the required schedules • Accuracy of schedule of amounts • Clarity of inclusions and exclusions 	15
3	<p>Experience in Similar Projects Council requires the Tenderer provides clear evidence of the tenderer's experience in fulfilling the requirements of similar contracts. Provide contact details that enable this information to be verified. Tenderers shall provide details of similar projects which have been recently completed, or under construction, together with referee contact details.</p>	10
4	<p>Corporate Capacity Evidence and references to demonstrate capacity of the Tenderer to fulfil the requirements of the proposed contract which includes: <u>Corporate and Financial Capacity and Insurances</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial Information • References from a Financial Institution • Tenderer's capacity to finance and undertake the project • Insurances Details & the extent thereof 	5
5	<p>Understanding of the Project & Workable Program The Tenderer must demonstrate their intended approach to the work including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of ability to carry out the work within time program provided • Understanding of site opportunities and constraints 	5
6	<p>OH&S & Safety Management Systems Tenderer to demonstrate that they have the required OH&S, Safety Management Systems, and Quality Assurance systems in place</p>	5

The summary of the evaluation is provided in the chart below:

Criteria	M Bruton Building Co	Dean Horton Builder	Sydney Design and Construction	Brownrite Building Group Pty Ltd	ECS	O'Brien Constructions Pty Ltd
1	40	35	30	30	20	15
2	15	15	5	12	15	15
3	10	10	0	0	10	10
4	3	5	0	0	5	5
5	3	5	0	0	5	5
6	5	5	0	0	5	5
TOTAL	76	75	35	42	60	55

It has been determined that M Bruton Building Co provided the best price while the tender documentation they submitted was limited. Dean Horton Builder submitted the most complete tender documentation based on a competitive price. Both companies have previously done contract work for Council.

TEN 05/13 Union Theatre Toilets Tender Breakdown

No	Description	M.Bruton Building Co	Dean Horton Builder	Sydney Design & Construction	Brownrite Building Group P/L	ECS	Peter O'Brien Constructions P/L
1	Preliminaries	50,380.00	17,701.20	154,935.55	56,804.00	41,197.20	33,833.06
2	Demolition	21,560.00	18,532.80	16,340.32	15,466.00	16,566.00	44,934.20
3	Groundwork	3,300.00	13,305.60	7,684.40	5,775.00		2,677.74
4	Concrete	29,920.00	88,563.20	39,864.50	50,248.00	74,140.00	53,717.73
5	Structural Steel	5,500.00	12,372.80	8,745.00	7,711.00	6,149.00	12,494.90
6	Masonry	24,860.00	27,782.70	18,731.79	32,296.00	34,210.00	28,775.12
7	Metalwork	18,480.00	31,698.70	8,395.20	32,648.00	33,396.00	47,634.55
8	Carpentry	67,100.00	27,511.00	41,206.44	76,516.00	37,092.00	66,699.22
9	Floor Finishes	14,300.00	3,984.20	10,248.70	12,650.00	12,100.00	25,002.30
10	Walls & Ceilings	5,610.00	28,096.20	10,879.44	18,414.00	11,550.00	32,245.04
11	Windows	36,850.00	12,916.20		8,943.00	18,282.00	11,727.81
12	Painting	7,810.00	15,681.60	11,660.00	11,825.00	8,316.00	8,780.20
13	Electrical Services	7,590.00	32,598.50	5,830.00	15,015.00	15,741.00	12,927.15
14	Hydraulic	35,200.00	12,100.00	37,301.29	32,439.00	32,220.10	48,408.29
15	Provisional Sums		30,602.00			32,199.20	
16	Contingency		7,467.60	37,182.29	32,296.00	37,315.30	42,981.23
Total GST inc.		\$328,460.00	\$380,914.60	\$409,005.14	\$409,046.00	\$410,473.80	\$472,838.54
Difference from Lowest Price			\$52,454.16	\$80,545.14	\$80,586.00	\$82,013.80	\$144,378.54

