

## COMBINED EVALUATION MATRIX

STAGE 4	WEIGHTING	ICON			RAPID (CONFORMING SUBMISSION)			RAPID (ALTERNATE SUBMISSION)		
		NOTES	SCORE (0-10)	WEIGHTED SCORE	NOTES	SCORE (0-10)	WEIGHTED SCORE	NOTES	SCORE (0-10)	WEIGHTED SCORE
TOTAL PRICE ex GST			\$2,251,630.00			\$1,947,180.00			\$1,983,791.00	
Meets Specifications (Y/N)										
Price	40%	Most Expensive	8.65	34.60	Least Expensive	10.00	40.00	Slightly more than Conforming	9.82	39.28
Demonstrated Experience and Past Performance	20%	Extremely concise submission indicates a depth of knowledge not shown in other submissions. References and examples of past work is outstanding - including the work currently being done on Stage 2/3 of the Aquatic Centre	9.67	19.34	Works are primarily subcontracted out. Experience isn't very highly detailed but is extensive. Based on external testimony however, work is completed on time and to specification.	7.17	14.34	Works are primarily subcontracted out. Experience isn't very highly detailed but is extensive. Based on external testimony however, work is completed on time and to specification.	6.67	13.34
Understanding of the Requirement	20%	Submission provides all applicable information in a concise format. The information provided directly applies to Council's brief and Icon explicitly seeks to maintain provided performance specifications. This shows an intimate knowledge of the process of construction and detail required for such a large engineering renovation.	10.00	20.00	Tender submission is extremely lengthy but not much applicable detail is provided. Many of the plant specifications do not comply with the requirements provided in the design brief. Also, no details or pricing is provided explaining how the plant equipment will fit/be installed in the existing building.	6.67	13.34	Tender submission is extremely lengthy but not much applicable detail is provided. Many of the plant specifications do not comply with the requirements provided in the design brief. Also, no details or pricing is provided explaining how the plant equipment will fit/be installed in the existing building.	6.50	13.00
Key Personnel	10%	Employees quality of work is proven by the quality of work produced by the Stage 2/3 construction of the Aquatic Centre as well as works done in other regional areas on similar projects.	8.83	8.83	References show demonstrated experience however, experience isn't demonstrated as it is with Icon. Again, every single qualification the key personnel possess is listed indicating a lack of knowledge of the specifics of the tender requirements.	8.00	8.00	References show experience however, experience isn't demonstrated as it is with Icon. Again, every single qualification the key personnel possess is listed indicating a lack of knowledge of the specifics of the tender requirements.	8.00	8.00
Demonstrated Capability and Capacity (Licences/Accreditations)	10%	Icon has demonstrated their capability through their concise tender submission, previous work in rural localities. Their projects are delivered to schedule and all employees/contractors are shown to be licenced and accredited.	8.50	8.50	There are multiple documents which iterate their WHS and quality policies which would be submitted for every tender. There are only a few documents which specifically pertain to the current project. Much of the information provided, such as the refurbishment instead of replacement of the pool centreline and the conversion of an existing filter cell into a backwash settlement tank, does not fit the specified project and will inhibit performance upon completion.	7.50	7.50	There are multiple documents which iterate their WHS and quality policies which would be submitted for every tender. There are only a few documents which specifically pertain to the current project. Much of the information provided, such as the refurbishment instead of replacement of the pool centreline and the conversion of an existing filter cell into a backwash settlement tank, does not fit the specified project and will inhibit performance upon completion.	7.50	7.50
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>100%</b>			<b>91.27</b>			<b>83.18</b>			<b>81.12</b>

Comparison of Schedule of Prices					
	Icon	Rapid (Conforming)	Rapid (Alternate)	Differences	
				Rapid (Conforming) and Icon	Rapid (Alternate) and Icon
<b>1. Preliminaries and Overheads</b> - General conditions, Insurances of the works, Public Liability Insurance, site establishment, set-out, co-ordination, project attendance, quality assurance, contract administration, submission of samples, works testing, management of specialist Consultants & Subcontractors, assistance to the Project Manager, progressive removal of wastes (environmental waste management), Occupational Health Safety Rehabilitation Plan, Survey of 50m Pool at completion, etc.	\$226,250	\$189,249	\$189,249	-\$37,001	-\$37,001
<b>2. Formal Design</b> - Component conducted by accredited Engineer(s) covering all aspects associated with structural engineering and pool water treatment plant. This cost includes attendance, testing, reporting, surveying, preparation of detailed design drawings, site inspections, and certification of the completed works including as built drawings and all documentation.	\$39,750	\$20,800	\$20,800	-\$18,950	-\$18,950

<p><b>3. Site Preparation Works and Excavation</b> - Including demolition of concourses and pool structure including all concrete cutting to walls and centre chase, loading trucks and transport to council waste site, any relocation or termination of underground services, pool, plant room and pipe service excavation, and reinstatement and or restoration of all adjacent surrounds and surface finishes in accordance with the projects overall design &amp; construct requirements. Include waste removal to council approved tip.</p>	\$172,540	\$85,117	\$101,206	-\$87,423	-\$71,334
<p><b>4. Subsurface Drainage</b> - Including one way valve collection system beneath liner connected to a pit with pump, subsurface agg line drainage around existing balance tank to prevent possible moisture ingress and new waterproofing delamination.</p>	\$37,125	\$34,705	\$34,705	-\$2,420	-\$2,420
<p><b>5. Waterproof Balance Tank</b> - Including minor repairs where necessary and application of Nitacote to underside of balance tank lid.</p>	\$39,150	Provisional Sum)	c. (Provisional Sum)	-\$39,150	-\$39,150
<p><b>6. 50m Pool Upgrade Works</b> - Wet deck gutters formed and poured, expansion joint through gutter repair using Sika Combiflex System, waterproof gutters with Nitacote, new stair access and reconstructed ramp, new concrete hobs to both ends, all required foundations, concrete works, all cast-in pipework, including new side inlet core holes and fittings, and the central chase as required in specification including fittings.</p>	\$290,160	\$263,158	\$352,726		

<b>7. 50m Pool Upgrade Works</b> - Including interior linings, finger grip and other tiles to gutters and hobs as required and as per specification.	See 9.	\$381,680	\$389,095		
<b>8. 50m Pool Upgrade Works</b> - Wet deck grates , 5 sets of stainless steel ladders, new stainless steel handrails, new diving blocks, new lane ropes and reels, backstroke poles, false start flags.	See 9.	\$149,750	\$79,816		
<b>9. 50m Pool Upgrade Works</b> - Including interior linings, wet deck gutters & grates & finger grip tiles, new stair access and reconstructed ramp, 5 sets of stainless steel ladders, new concrete hobs to both ends, new diving blocks, new lane ropes, backstroke poles, false start flags, foundations, concrete works, cast-in pipework, including new side inlet adjustable inlets and the central chase adjustable floor inlet fittings, etc.	\$595,050	Included	Included	-\$90,622	-\$63,573
<b>10. Gravity Sand Filter Upgrade</b> - For the refurbished 50m pool, including water and electrical supply and sewer connection and integration with new backwash tank, repair & waterproofing internal trough of filter cells with Nitacote.	\$454,300	\$438,433	\$513,276	-\$15,867	\$58,976
<b>11. New Concrete Concourses/Pool Surrounds</b> - To the extent where specified surrounding upgraded 50 metre pool, including new concourse drainage system, and concrete formed seats as shown on drawings.	\$127,155	\$156,170	\$163,450	\$29,015	\$36,295

<b>12. Backwash Detention Tank</b> - Supply & install – including excavation cost and backfill and re turfing area of impact. Price to include all required pumps and associated plumbing from filter backwash sump, and to sewer. A minimum capacity of 90,000 litres is required. See the outline proposal in the specification.	\$102,160	\$88,650	Not required	-\$13,510	-\$102,160
<b>13. Pool Blankets and Rollers</b> - Thermal pool blankets on stainless steel rollers + blanket buddy – this is to be a possible take out price if budget is not permitting.	\$72,680	\$49,468	\$49,468	-\$23,212	-\$23,212
<b>14. Sundry Works</b> - Sundry works that cannot be reasonably allocated within the cost elements, that are deemed essential for the specific intent. Provide details of specific items.	\$5,310	N/A	N/A	-\$5,310	-\$5,310
<b>Provisional Sums</b>					
<b>15. New Shade Structure</b> - New shade structure over concrete tiered seating TBA on design type Provisional Sum of \$50,000 is to be allocated as demonstrated cost to builder.	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$50,000	\$0	\$0
<b>16. New Shade Structure</b> - New shade structure over deep end of 50m pool – snow loading Provisional Sum of \$40,000 is to be allocated as demonstrated cost to builder.	\$40,000	\$40,000	\$40,000	\$0	\$0
Total	\$2,251,630	\$1,947,180	\$1,983,791	-\$304,450	-\$267,839
GST	\$225,163.0	\$194,718.0	\$198,379.10	-\$30,445.0	-\$26,783.9
<b>Total inc. GST</b>	<b>\$2,476,793.0</b>	<b>\$2,141,898.0</b>	<b>\$2,182,170.10</b>	<b>-\$334,895.0</b>	<b>-\$294,622.90</b>